



Making Ontario's Electricity Market Work

presented by
Jan Carr, CEO, Ontario Power Authority
at
CAMPUT 2005

Objectives of Electricity Restructuring

- **disappointment with outcomes can result from having unclear objectives**
 - UK targeted and achieved reduced prices
 - Ontario prices were already too low - \$25 billion Ontario Hydro debt
- **Ontario restructuring objective was to remove investment risk from customers**
 - a long-term objective that gets lost in the short time horizons of public politics

Ontario's Original Failure to Deliver Restructuring Benefits

- **original restructuring had the right end point**
 - full wholesale and retail competition
 - maximize wholesale market liquidity through participation of aggregated retail loads
 - liquid market allows hedging of investment risk
- **but had a flawed implementation plan**
 - inadequate measures to prevent market domination by incumbent generator (OPG)
 - retail customers inadequately protected
 - » no information to compare competitive supply offer with “do nothing”
 - » “do nothing” (default) supply was spot market pass-through
 - » complex “unbundled” bills reflected economic theory but not consumer attitudes
- **consumer backlash translated into political intervention**
 - retail prices frozen
 - apparent reversal of government policy created uncertainty which resulted in:
 - » massive loss of liquidity in wholesale market
 - » cessation of all investment

Ontario's Second Restructuring – Focus on Implementation

- **a parallel “administered pricing” system has been added to the existing competitive pricing system**
 - OPA is central to the administered pricing system
- **objective is to manage the migration of risk away from consumers and toward investors**
 - avoids the need for a “leap of faith” that the “big bang” of market opening will result in adequate liquidity to assure investment while transferring risk
- **as competitive market grows administered pricing will shrink and risk will be transferred**
 - OPA is a transitional organization with the objective of making this happen

OPA Core Functions

- **power system planning**
 - medium and long term planning for capital additions to generation and transmission
- **conservation bureau**
 - developing and implementing CDM programs
- **generation development**
 - facilitating investment in new generation and CDM projects
- **retail services**
 - smooth pricing based on real costs

Power System Planning

- **responsible for medium and long term planning as basis for:**
 - **procurement of generation and conservation projects by OPA**
 - **construction of transmission by transmission system owners**
- **Government has reserved right to prescribe the mix of energy sources for generation and conservation targets**
 - **early action under planning mandate will be undertaking some analysis to inform government decision on energy sources and conservation targets**

Conservation Bureau

- **development and delivery of conservation and demand management (CDM) programs**
- **OPA will be providing support to CDM initiatives in two ways**
 - **Conservation Bureau funding for pilot projects**
 - » to overcome “first-mover” hurdles for new technology
 - » seed funding to move from concept to commercially free-standing
 - **Generation Development support in parallel with new supply**

Generation Development

- **some \$20-\$30 billion new investment needed over the next 10-20 years**
 - OPA contracts with new generators to provide long-term pricing assurance
 - allows developers to obtain financing – OPA a “creditworthy counterparty”
- **support will be provided only to the extent necessary to make investment feasible**
 - generators will have to buy and sell in competitive market to make ends meet
- **OPA creditworthiness derives from its authority to recover all costs paid to generators from customers**
 - Province is not obligated
- **effectively, generation development role transfers risk away from investors and on to customers**
 - amount transferred will be just sufficient to achieve the desired investment

Retail Services

- **acts as the shock absorber to recover full cost of power purchases through smooth retail rates**
 - **subsidizes rates during peaks, collects surcharge during valleys**
 - **retail rate based on forecast of prices**
 - » any balance due to forecasting error collected/rebated in subsequent period
- **anticipate migrating away from pure financial smoothing toward conventional hedging through purchasing portfolio of longer-term purchases in wholesale electricity market**
- **migration is an important element to risk born by customers**

Market Evolution and Risk Migration

- **separate responsibility for supply of default customers from (90+) distributors and consolidate into 5 Load Serving Entity (LSE) licenses**
- **specify rate structure and auction off licenses for fixed term to lowest bidders**
 - bid prices become the rates
- **licensees at risk for forecasting and volume**
 - no deferral account necessary
- **licensees will hedge risk by contracting forward**
 - creates market for generators to sell forward into
 - reduces support necessary from OPA
- **similar to approach used in several US states and Alberta**
- **retail customers relieved of risk in two ways:**
 - elimination of deferral account removes forecasting and volume risk
 - improved wholesale market liquidity reduces support payments to generators (which are recovered from customers as a market uplift charge)

Summary

- **competitive restructuring must be implemented in a fashion that is acceptable to customers**
 - **all customers – including low-volume residential and small commercial customers**
- **Ontario's new hybrid structure is intended to migrate toward a competitive structure**
 - **administered pricing channel to be managed to progressively enhance competitive pricing channel**
- **overall purpose is to ensure adequate new investment in infrastructure while transferring investment risk away from customers in a controlled way**



www.powerauthority.on.ca

**175 Bloor Street East, North Tower, Suite 606
Toronto, Ontario M4W 3R8**

416-967-7474