

	Utility	Sponsor	Utility Proposal	Booth Proposal	Other	Decision
2010	Enbridge Line 9	Imperial Oil	12.0/12.6/12.18% ROE 2008/09/10 on 50% CE	7.75/8.25/8.25% ROE 2008/09/10 on 45% CE	n/a	Settled. Black box. NEB RH-1-2010
2010	Gazifere	IGUA	11.25% (revised to 10.95%) ROE on 40% CE ROE includes allowance for risk of utility	8.5% ROE on 40% CE ROE includes allowance for risk of utility (25BP) and financial crisis (50BP)	n/a	9.10% ROE on 40% for 2011. ROE includes allowance for higher risk of utility (~30BP) and 30 BP for financial crisis. For Gazifere in 2012 the Regie will use the revised formula proposed by Dr. Booth. Regie d’Energie D-2010-147
2010	EGNB	Public Intervenor	12.75% ROE on 50% CE ROE includes allowance for risk of utility (100-200BP)	9.0% ROE on 40% CE ROE includes allowance for risk of utility (100BP)	n/a	10.9% ROE on 45% for 2011 ROE includes allowance for EGNB risks of 2.75% vs benchmark utility ROE of 8.13% Nov.30, 2010 N.B. EUB
2010	Maritime Electric	Dept of Energy	9.75% ROE on 41 – 41.8% CE	8% on 40% CE (40% a legislated figure)	n/a	9.75% ROE apparently on 40% CE for 2010/11 Order UE10-03 PEI Regulatory and Appeals Commission
2009	AUC GCC	CAPP/Calgary	10.5-12.0% ROEs on various CE (AP 12% on 43%; ATCO Gas 11% on 40%)	Formula ROE (8.61% 2009) alt.7.25% on CE for AP of 37% pre-and 33% post-NGTL integration and for ATCO gas 35%	7.9% ROE on various CE	9.0% ROE on various CE (AP 45; ATCO Gas 39) for 2009/10 ROE includes 50BP for financial crisis.
2009	Gaz Metro	IGUA	7.75%	Formula	n/a	9.2% ROE on 38.5% CE

			ATWACC (= 12.39% ROE on 38.5% CE)	(8.64%) on 38.5% CE		from Oct.1, 2009 through 2011 ROE includes adjustment for Gaz Metro risk and financial crisis. ATWACC method rejected Regie d'Energie D-2009-156
2009	NL Power	Consumer Advocate	11% ROE on 45% CE	Formula ROE (8.48%) or alt. 7.75% on 45% CE	9.6% on 45% CE	9.0% on 45% CE for 2010, formula for 2011/12 ROE includes 50BP for financial market risks and NP's credit metrics NL BCPU P.U. 43 (2009)
2009	Terasen Gas	JIESC/CE CABC/BC OAPO	11% ROE on 40% CE for TGI (TGVI +70BP; TGW +50BP)	Formula ROE (8.43%) alt. 7.75% TGI on 35% CE	n/a	9.5% ROE on 40% CE (TGVI & TGW +50BP) as of July 1, 2009 BCUC Dec.16, 2009
2008	TQM	CAPP/IGU A	11% ROE on 40% CE (6.9% ATWACC)	Formula ROE (8.46/8.71% 2007/08) alt. 7.75% on 32% CE	Formula on 36% CE 200-300BP increase in return	6.4% ATWACC (=9.7% ROE on 40% CE)
2008	OPG	VECC	10.5% ROE on 57.5% CE	7.75% ROE on 40% CE	7.35/7.40% ROE on 47% CE 7.64% ROE on 45% CE	8.65% ROE on 47% CE for 2009/09 OEB EB-2007-0905
2007	Gaz Metro	IGUA	8.26% return on rate base	8.0% on 38.5% CE	n/a	9.05% ROE on 38.5% CE as of oct.1, 2007 Return on rate base of 7.68% Regie d'Energie

						D-2007-116
2007	Hydro One	CCC/VEC C	10.5% revised to 10.0/10.5% ROE 2007/08 on 40%	Formula ROE alt. 7.75% ROE on 34%	n/a	Formula ROE of 8.35% for 2007/08 on same equity as distributors (40%). Note: Unclear if OEB viewed the 36% CE and 4% pref. as equivalent to that allowed distributors. OEB EB-2006-0501
2006	EGD	CCC/IGU A/VECC	38% CE	35% CE		36% CE OEB EB-2006-0034
2006	Union	CCC/IGU A/VECC	40% CE	35% CE		Settlement of 36% CE OEB EB-2005-0520